

**Scotland's Census 2021
Ethnic Group and Religion Update**

Table of Contents

1. Main Points	3
2. Introduction	4
3. Background	5
3.1 Ethnic group and religion in Scotland's Census	5
4. 2018 and 2019 Question Testing	7
5. 2018 and 2019 Ethnic Group Question Testing	7
5.1 African	7
5.2 Caribbean or Black	9
5.3 Roma	10
5.4 Scottish Showpeople	12
5.5 Jewish	12
5.6 Sikh	15
5.7 Other findings	17
6. 2019 Religion Question Testing	17
6.1 Muslim	17
6.2 Pagan	19
6.3 Other findings	19
7. Next Steps	20
Annex A: Cognitive Focus Groups	21
Annex B: 2019 Qualitative Survey Test	26
Annex C: 2019 Qualitative Survey Questions	40
Annex D: Scotland's Census 2011 Ethnic Group by Religion	52

1. Main Points

- Ethnic group and religion are some of the most widely used census variables. In the [Topic Consultation Report](#) (PDF) National Records of Scotland proposed to continue to collect information on ethnic group and religion in 2021.
- National Records of Scotland considered a limited number of requests for the response options to be reviewed and/or additional information to be collected through the ethnic group and religion questions.
- At this stage, the following changes for the ethnic group question will be recommended to the Scottish Parliament:
 - a tick box for “Roma”
 - a tick box for “Showpeople” or “Showperson”
 - a prompt to write in “Jewish” in the “Other ethnic group” category
 - a design change to the “African” category to improve data quality
 - a design change to the “Caribbean or Black” category to improve data quality
- NRS will continue to work with data users to consider how ethnic group outputs can be created to best meet user need.
- At this stage, the following changes for the religion question will be recommended to the Scottish Parliament:
 - a tick box for “Pagan”
 - a prompt to write in for Muslim to provide more data to meet identified user need.
- The digital first approach for 2021 requires further development and user testing to fully understand the best way to present the questions online to maximise response, minimise respondent burden and ensure good quality data which meets user needs.
- Question and outputs development is on-going to look at how the suite of questions related to the Equality Act 2010 work together to provide equality outputs.

2. Introduction

This topic update sets out the evidence gathered in National Record of Scotland's (NRS's) further consideration of requests for the response options to be reviewed and/or additional information to be collected through the census ethnic group and religion questions.

As ethnic group, religion and national identity are related aspects of identity, these questions were tested together.

The 2021 Census questionnaire must gather high quality data that meets user needs. The [Scotland's Census 2021 Topic Consultation](#) identified a strong continued need for data on ethnic group and religion to be collected in the census. More information about [key elements of the design](#) for 2021 can be found online.

Two frameworks have been published by National Records of Scotland (NRS) to evaluate the effectiveness of [question design for existing, alternative and new questions](#) (PDF) and to evaluate the effectiveness of [question design of tick box response options](#) (PDF).

Questions and their response options are evaluated against five main themes:

Strength of user need

- ✓ Data collected by the census must meet a user need for equality monitoring, policy development, resource allocation and/or service planning and delivery.

Suitability of alternative sources

- ✓ Data collected by the census must meet a user need that cannot be met elsewhere.

Acceptability, clarity and data quality

- ✓ Questions asked in the census must be acceptable to the majority of the public, clear and be designed with minimal respondent burden in order to obtain good data quality that meets user needs.

Comparability

- ✓ Data collected by the census should be comparable over time where possible, and harmonised across the UK where reasonable.

Operational considerations

- ✓ Census questions must be considered as part of the census as a whole, where effective digital and paper design, space and financial constraints must be considered. Additionally, some questions may be required for operational purposes in the process of conducting the census.

An iterative and comprehensive process of user consultation, evaluation and prioritisation of user requirements, and qualitative and quantitative question testing has been carried out to inform the decisions about the ethnic group and religion questions to be recommended for inclusion in the 2021 Census. More information is available in our [Ethnic Group Topic Report](#) (PDF) and [Religion Topic Report](#) (PDF), published in September 2018.

NRS has engaged with range of stakeholders who have expressed requirements for the ethnic group or religion question response options to be reviewed and/or

additional information to be collected. This information has been evaluated for strength of user need.

In the [Ethnic Group Topic Report](#) (PDF) and [Religion Topic Report](#) (PDF), published in September 2018, NRS outlined the areas being taken forward for further investigation. For ethnic group, response options have been reviewed for Scottish Showpeople, Roma, Sikh and Jewish groups, and consideration has been given to the design of the “African” and “Caribbean or Black” categories to improve data quality. For religion, response options have been reviewed for Pagan and Muslim groups.

The final decision on the content of Scotland’s Census 2021 questionnaire will be made by the Scottish Parliament.

As in previous years, there will be separate censuses conducted by the Office for National Statistics (ONS) in England and Wales, and the Northern Ireland Statistics and Research Agency (NISRA) in Northern Ireland. The three census offices work together to develop a set of questions that, wherever possible and necessary, will deliver harmonised outputs across the UK.

3. Background

3.1 Ethnic group and religion in Scotland’s Census

Ethnicity is a complicated and sensitive concept. Peoples’ concept of their ethnicity, and the way that they choose to express it, changes over time. The format and content of this question has changed with each census to reflect this and best meet user needs, while retaining an element of comparability over time and with the rest of the UK. A national identity question was included for the first time in 2011 as a preceding companion question to the ethnic group question.

Religion is a related and complementary concept to ethnic group in the census. As with ethnic group, the format and content of this question has been evaluated each census to ensure that the data collected can best meet user needs and retain an element of comparability over time and with the rest of the UK.

The 2011 Census religion, national identity and ethnic group questions are shown in Figure 1. More information about these questions and question development for the 2021 Census is available in our [Religion Topic Report](#) (PDF), [National Identity Topic Report](#) (PDF) and [Ethnic Group Topic Report](#) (PDF).

The 2011 Census asked a question about current religious belonging which asked “what religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?”. This question collected information about religious groups, and Christian denominations through tick boxes and write in responses.

The 2011 Census ethnic group question asked “What is your ethnic group?”. Response options were organised into the high level categories “White”, “Mixed or multiple ethnic groups”, “Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British”, “African”, “Caribbean or Black”, and “Other ethnic group”. Tick box response options and write in fields were available under these categories.

In 2011, online versions of the religion, national identity and ethnic group questions had the same layout and content as the paper questions shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1: 2011 Census Religion, National Identity and Ethnic Group Questions

13 What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?
 ♦ This question is voluntary.

- ☐ None
- ☐ Church of Scotland
- ☐ Roman Catholic
- ☐ Other Christian, please write in below
- ☐ Muslim
- ☐ Buddhist
- ☐ Sikh
- ☐ Jewish
- ☐ Hindu
- ☐ Another religion or body, please write in

15 What is your ethnic group?
 ♦ Choose **ONE** section from A to F, then tick **ONE** box which **best describes** your ethnic group or background.

A White

- ☐ Scottish
- ☐ Other British
- ☐ Irish
- ☐ Gypsy / Traveller
- ☐ Polish
- ☐ Other white ethnic group, please write in

B Mixed or multiple ethnic groups

- ☐ Any mixed or multiple ethnic groups, please write in

C Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British

- ☐ Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British
- ☐ Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British
- ☐ Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British
- ☐ Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British
- ☐ Other, please write in

D African

- ☐ African, African Scottish or African British
- ☐ Other, please write in

E Caribbean or Black

- ☐ Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British
- ☐ Black, Black Scottish or Black British
- ☐ Other, please write in

F Other ethnic group

- ☐ Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British
- ☐ Other, please write in

14 What do you feel is your national identity?
 ♦ Tick **ALL** that apply.

- ☐ Scottish
- ☐ English
- ☐ Welsh
- ☐ Northern Irish
- ☐ British
- ☐ Other, please write in

4. 2018 and 2019 Question Testing

This section provides background about the question testing process carried out by NRS to consider a limited number of requests for potential changes to the ethnic group question for Scotland's Census 2021.

Cognitive focus groups and qualitative survey testing processes are used in developing census questions:

- Cognitive testing is a form of in depth interviewing with a small number of respondents. It aims to provide an insight into the mental processes respondents use when answering questions. This helps us to identify if there are any problems with a question or question design and gain an insight into the source of any difficulty respondents are having. Focus groups are a type of in-depth group interview that explore people's knowledge and experiences and provide multiple perspectives on a topic.
- Qualitative survey testing is undertaken primarily to gain an understanding of clarity and potential data quality issues. NRS included feedback questions in the qualitative survey testing in order to gather further information on acceptability, identify specific difficulties respondents faced if they were unable to answer a question easily and to understand preferences.

In 2018 and 2019 cognitive focus group testing was undertaken to explore the issues and impact of the inclusion of a tick box for "Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British" in the ethnic group question. This took into consideration the acceptability of the response option and what impact its inclusion would have on data quality, clarity and comparability over time. More information about this testing is available in [Annex A](#).

In early 2019 a qualitative survey tested potential changes to the religion and ethnic group questions for inclusion in Scotland's Census 2021. This survey explored acceptability and potential impacts on data quality and comparability over time of the inclusion of additional tick boxes and changes to question design of the religion and ethnic group questions. More information about this testing is available in [Annex B](#).

5. 2018 and 2019 Ethnic Group Question Testing

5.1 African

A strong user need has been expressed for collecting more detailed information about African ethnic groups in Scotland. The aggregate level of data available for this group from the 2011 Census was considered to mask specific African ethnic groups that have particular needs.

An [African Ethnic Groups Focus Group](#) was held with data users and members of the African community in Scotland to discuss how to best meet these needs. The focus group suggested preferred question design options for NRS to take forward. A write in option to capture African ethnic groups was thought to best meet user need given the large number and complexity of African ethnic groups. The summary of this focus group is available [online](#).

Following further research to identify the design option likely to provide the highest quality data, NRS included an alternative African category design for qualitative survey testing in 2019. The African category in the 2011 style question and

alternative questions included in the 2019 test are shown in Figure 2. The full ethnic group questions included in this test are shown in [Annex C](#).

Figure 2: African categories included in 2019 qualitative online survey

2011 Census response options
<p>14. Which one best describes your African ethnic group or background?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Select one only <p><input type="radio"/> African, African Scottish or African British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Other, please enter:</p> <div style="border: 1px solid #ccc; height: 20px; width: 580px; margin-top: 5px;"></div>
Alternative ethnic group question
<p>25. Please enter your African ethnic group or background (for example, Nigerian, Somali)</p> <div style="border: 1px solid #ccc; height: 25px; width: 580px; margin-top: 5px;"></div>

The key results from the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- There were no acceptability issues with the alternative design. Including “Scottish” and “British” may further increase acceptability.
- Almost all African respondents provided detailed information about their African ethnic group or background in the alternative ethnic group question. This information meets the user need for detailed data about African ethnic groups. There was also an indication that this design improves the quality of data entered by respondents who would choose to write in, compared to the 2011 Census question.
- Testing demonstrated there would be no comparability issues over time at category level. Comparability with the rest of the UK would be expected at aggregate category level. The Office for National Statistics have also recommended that for 2021, the ethnic group question in England and Wales should include an option for those selecting “African” within the “Black,

African, Caribbean or Black British” category to write in a more specific ethnic background, providing for the collection of comparable data.

5.2 Caribbean or Black

Stakeholders and testing participants expressed concerns about parity of design across the ethnic group question. The design of the ethnic group question as a whole has been considered by NRS in order to provide as much parity as possible while reducing respondent burden and capturing data to meet user needs.

To provide parity across the question, and to capture more detailed data, a write in response for the “Caribbean or Black” category was tested. This design maintains comparability across time. The alternative design was included for testing in the 2019 qualitative online survey is shown in Figure 3. The full ethnic group questions included in this test are shown in [Annex C](#).

Figure 3: Caribbean or Black categories included in 2019 qualitative online survey

2011 Census response options
<p>15. Which one best describes your Caribbean or Black ethnic group or background?</p> <p>• Select one only</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Black, Black Scottish or Black British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Other, please enter:</p> <div></div>
Alternative ethnic group question
<p>26. Please enter your Caribbean or Black ethnic group or background (for example, Caribbean Scottish, Black Scottish)</p> <div></div>

The key results from the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- No acceptability issues were indicated with the alternative question. However, there were a small number of Caribbean or Black respondents to the 2019 qualitative survey.
- All respondents provided write in responses to the alternative ethnic group question.
- The alternative design allows comparability over time and across the UK at category level.

5.3 Roma

A strong user need has been expressed for collecting information about Roma in Scotland. There are no alternative sources for this information.

Research in England and Wales by ONS showed “Roma” was considered the most appropriate term to use for the Roma community and that the placement of a “Roma” tick box under the “White” high-level category was acceptable, with participants feeling that they should be placed in close proximity to the “Gypsy or Irish Traveller” tick box. This placement made it easier for respondents to locate the tick box.¹

A tick box for “Roma” was included for qualitative survey testing in Scotland under the “White” category following the tick box for “Gypsy / Traveller”, as shown in Figure 4. The full ethnic group questions included in this test are shown in [Annex C](#).

The key results from the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- The inclusion and placement of a “Roma” tick box was acceptable and preferred by most respondents. However, there were a small number of Roma respondents to the 2019 qualitative survey.
- The alternative question improves data quality to meet user need. All respondents identified as Roma in the alternative question by combining responses to the Roma tick box with write in responses compared to half in the question with 2011 Census response options.
- Although the alternative question improved data quality to meet user need, not all respondents chose to select the “Roma” tick box. While the location of the tick box has been shown to improve data quality, be generally acceptable, and easy to locate, NRS will consider how outputs can be created across ethnic group categories to best meet user need.
- Acceptable comparability over time is expected at category level. Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK. The ONS have also recommended that for 2021, the

¹ [2021 Census topic research update: December 2018](#), *The Office for National Statistics*

ethnic group question in England and Wales should include a tick-box for “Roma” within the “White” category under “Gypsy or Irish Traveller”, providing for the collection of comparable data on Roma.

Figure 4: White categories included in 2019 qualitative online survey

2011 Census response options

11. Which one best describes your white ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

☐ Scottish
 ☐ Other British
 ☐ Irish
 ☐ Gypsy / Traveller
 ☐ Polish
 ☐ Other white ethnic group, please enter:

Alternative ethnic group question

22. Which one best describes your white ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

☐ Scottish
 ☐ Other British
 ☐ Irish
 ☐ Gypsy / Traveller
 ☐ Roma
 ☐ Showpeople
 ☐ Polish
 ☐ Other white ethnic group, please enter:

5.4 Scottish Showpeople

A strong user need has been expressed for collecting information about Scottish Showpeople in Scotland. There are no alternative sources for this information.

A tick box for “Showpeople” was included for qualitative survey testing in Scotland under the “White” category following tick boxes for “Gypsy / Traveller” and “Roma”, as shown in Figure 4. The full ethnic group questions included in this test are shown in [Annex C](#).

The key results from the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- The inclusion of a tick box for “Showpeople” was highly acceptable, with the majority of respondents selecting this option in the alternative ethnic group question.
- The alternative question improved data quality to meet user need. However, many write in’s across the ethnic group questions in this test were for “Showman” or “Showperson” rather than “Showpeople”. A tick box for “Showperson” rather than “Showpeople” may improve both acceptability and data quality.
- While the location of the tick box has been shown to improve data quality, be highly acceptable, and generally easy to locate, NRS will consider how outputs can be created across ethnic group categories to best meet user need.
- The alternative question design provides acceptable comparability over time at category level. Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

5.5 Jewish

A strong user need has been expressed for collecting information about the Jewish population in Scotland.

Information about the Jewish population in Scotland has historically been captured through data about religion. A question on current religious belonging has been included in Scotland’s Census since 2001, and this information is also captured through the three largest surveys in Scotland: the Scottish Household Survey (SHS); the Scottish Health Survey (SHeS); and the Scottish Crime and Justice Survey (SCJS).

Stakeholders expressed concerns that using religion as proxy for the Jewish population risks undercounting the population. They highlighted the difference in the numbers of identifying as Jewish in the current religion question included in the 2001 census (6,448) and in the religion of upbringing question included in the 2001 census (7,446), and their continued application of this difference (13%) to provide an estimate for the size of the Jewish population in Scotland.

The religion of upbringing question was not included in the 2011 Census. Table 1 shows the number of write ins for “Jewish” in the ethnic group question in 2011 by ethnic group category by the respondents’ response to the 2011 religion question. In the 2011 Census, 5,887 people identified as Jewish through the question on current religious belonging. There were 812 write in responses for “Jewish” in the ethnic group question. Of these respondents, 219 (27%) did not identify as Jewish in the religion question.

Table 1: 2011 Census ethnic group write ins for “Jewish” by religion

Detailed ethnic group category	Religion		
	Jewish	Other (1)	Total
All people	5,887	5,289,516	5,295,403
Write-in response of 'Jewish'			
Total	593	219	812
Other White	472	172	644
Mixed or multiple ethnic group	18	22	40
Other Asian	0	0	0
Other African	0	0	0
Other Caribbean or Black	0	0	0
Other Ethnic Group	103	25	128
All other ethnic groups	5,294	5,289,297	5,294,591

(1) Includes other religions and 'Religion not stated'.

A tick box for “Jewish, Jewish Scottish or Jewish British” was included for qualitative survey testing in Scotland under the “Other ethnic group” category following tick boxes for “Arab, Arab Scottish and Arab British” and “Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British”, as shown in Figure 5. The full ethnic group questions included in this test are shown in [Annex C](#).

The key results from the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- The inclusion of Jewish was largely acceptable. The placement of a Jewish option under “Other ethnic group” was mostly acceptable, but caused difficulty for some respondents.
- Results indicate that the best estimation of the Jewish population is likely to be the estimate obtained from the religion question (around 90%) plus those who identify ethnically only by responses across ethnic group categories (around 10%). NRS will consider how outputs can be created to best meet this user need.
- Including a tick box improved data quality on the Jewish population gathered by ethnic group but did not improve estimation of the total population size in this test. There was no evidence that including a tick box increased the capture of people who identified as ethnically Jewish but not religiously Jewish in this test. These people mostly chose to express their Jewish identity

by writing this in to the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options.

- Including a prompt to write in to indicate to respondents that Jewish is an acceptable response to the ethnic group question would likely result in the same overall improvements in data quality and may reduce issues with acceptability of the placement of a tick box.
- Acceptably comparable category level data would be achievable by aggregating a Jewish tick box with the “White” category. Acceptable comparability at category level would allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

Figure 5: Other ethnic group categories included in 2019 qualitative online survey

2011 Census response options
<p>16. Which one best describes your other ethnic group or background?</p> <p>• Select one only</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Other, please enter:</p> <div style="border: 1px solid #ccc; height: 20px; width: 570px; margin-top: 5px;"></div>
Alternative ethnic group question
<p>27. Which one best describes your other ethnic group or background?</p> <p>• Select one only</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Jewish, Jewish Scottish or Jewish British</p> <p><input type="radio"/> Other, please enter:</p> <div style="border: 1px solid #ccc; height: 20px; width: 575px; margin-top: 5px;"></div>

5.6 Sikh

A strong user need has been expressed for collecting information about the Sikh population in Scotland.

Information about the Sikh population in Scotland has historically been captured through data about religion. A question on current religious belonging has been included in Scotland's Census since 2001, and this information is also captured through the three largest surveys in Scotland: the Scottish Household Survey (SHS); the Scottish Health Survey (SHeS); and the Scottish Crime and Justice Survey (SCJS).

Stakeholders expressed concerns that using religion as proxy for the Sikh population risks undercounting the population, and raised concerns that some of the population do not identify with the options included in the 2011 Census ethnic group question.

The evidence for a potential undercount of the Sikh population through the religion question in the 2001 Census and 2011 Census is less strong.

In 2001, 6,572 people identified as Sikh through the current religion question, and 6,821 people identified their religion of upbringing as Sikh, a difference of 3.7%.

Table 2 shows the number of write ins for "Sikh" in the ethnic group question in 2011 by ethnic group category by the respondents' response to the 2011 religion question. In the 2011 Census, 9,055 people identified as Sikh through the question on current religious belonging. There were 873 write in responses for "Sikh" in the ethnic group question. Of these respondents, 26 (3%) did not identify as Sikh in the religion question.

Table 2: 2011 Census ethnic group write ins for "Sikh" by religion

Detailed ethnic group category	Religion		
	Sikh	Other (1)	Total
All people	9,055	5,286,348	5,295,403
Write-in response of 'Sikh'			
Total	847	26	873
Other White or Mixed or multiple ethnic groups (2)	21	3	24
Other Asian	545	11	556
Other African	0	0	0
Other Caribbean or Black	31	0	31
Other Ethnic Group	250	12	262
All other ethnic groups	8,208	5,286,322	5,294,530

(1) Includes other religions, no religion and 'Religion not stated'.

(2) 'Other White' and 'Mixed or multiple ethnic groups' have been grouped together to protect against disclosure of personal information.

A tick box for "Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British" was tested in focus groups with Sikh participants. Within each group, participants were asked to respond to the 2011 Census questions on religion, national identity and ethnic group on paper. Following

this, participants were asked to feedback on the acceptability, quality and clarity of two different designs of the ethnic group question and to compare these designs with each other and the 2011 Census question. A “Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British” tick box was included under “Other ethnic group” in alternative version A of the ethnic group question and under “Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British” in version B, as shown in [Annex A](#).

A tick box for “Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British” was included for qualitative survey testing in Scotland under the “Other ethnic group” category following the tick box for “Arab, Arab Scottish and Arab British”, as shown in Figure 5. The full ethnic group questions included in this test are shown in [Annex C](#).

Key results from cognitive focus groups and the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex A](#) and [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- The inclusion of a Sikh tick box was found to be acceptable to many focus group participants. However, there were some strong acceptability issues. Some participants found the inclusion of religion under ethnic group unacceptable, inappropriate or confusing. This made them question what they were being asked for. Some felt that religion and ethnic group should be separated or that this was repetitive since they had already selected Sikh under religion. Participants who found the tick box acceptable, and those that didn't, questioned why Sikh was the only religion included. Some felt singled out or that inclusion would only be acceptable if other religions were included or the question wording was changed. In comparison, there were very few acceptability issues with the 2011 Census question.
- The inclusion of Sikh as was largely acceptable in the qualitative online survey, but the placement of Sikh under “Other ethnic group” continued to cause difficulty for some respondents.
- Focus group participants who naturally identified as “Scottish Sikh” or “British Sikh” typically found a question including a Sikh tick box easier to answer because they could locate a response more easily. However, other participants were clear they would not select a Sikh option in ethnic group, found the inclusion of the tick box confusing and found it more difficult. Some participants multi-ticked or initially missed the Sikh tick box and later changed their answer. These results suggest that a Sikh tick box would undercount the population and that there may be other impacts on data quality.
- In the qualitative online survey, a larger proportion of the Sikh population could be identified as Sikh through the alternative question. However, the religion question provided the best information on the Sikh population.
- There is a risk that if data from ethnic group was used alone, this figure would undercount the Sikh population. NRS will consider how equality related outputs are presented to meet user need.
- Acceptable comparability at category level would be achieved with a Sikh tick box under the Asian category. Comparable category level data would otherwise be achievable by aggregating a Sikh tick box under “Other ethnic group” with the Asian category. Acceptable comparability at category level, which might be achieved by aggregating different groups, would allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

5.7 Other findings

A general population sample was included in the 2019 qualitative survey to investigate whether changes impact acceptability or data quality for the general population. There was no indication of acceptability, or data quality issues for this group with any changes in ethnic group.

The majority of respondents to the survey did not indicate any difficulty answering questions on ethnic group and were comfortable answering these questions. The responses of those that did have been analysed to investigate general issues with this question. The majority of issues highlighted with ethnic group are unlikely to be resolved within the framework of the existing ethnic group question which offers comparability over time, or may be improved by the additional question guidance that will be available alongside the 2021 Census questionnaire.

In addition, respondents who indicated difficulty with the associated national identity question may benefit from the additional question guidance that will be available alongside the 2021 Census questionnaire.

6. 2019 Religion Question Testing

6.1 Muslim

User need has been expressed for more detailed information on branches or schools of Islam to be captured through the census religion question, in a similar way to how data on Christian denominations is captured. There are no alternative sources of this information.

A prompt for Muslim respondents to write in, leaving how to identify open to respondents, was included for qualitative survey testing in Scotland, as shown in Figure 5.

The key results from the 2019 qualitative survey test are described below. More detail is available in [Annex B](#).

Key results:

- The alternative religion question was found to be slightly more acceptable than the 2011 religion question.
- The majority of respondents wrote in and further specified their religious group in the alternative question, gathering data to meet user need.
- Comparability over time is expected at category level ("Muslim") and would allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.
- Some respondents indicated that they would prefer a tick box for their denomination. User need for this information is not stronger than the user need for other census questions or religion response options, and this test has shown that user need is met by having a write in prompt. Two additional tick boxes would be required in the question to meet this data need.

Figure 5: Religion questions included in 2019 qualitative online survey

Alternative religion question

8. What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?

- This question is voluntary

- ☐ None
- ☐ Church of Scotland
- ☐ Roman Catholic
- ☐ Other Christian, please write in below
- ☐ Muslim, please write in below
- ☐ Buddhist
- ☐ Sikh
- ☐ Jewish
- ☐ Hindu
- ☐ Pagan

Another religion or body, please write in

2011 Census religion question

19. What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?

- This question is voluntary

- ☐ None
- ☐ Church of Scotland
- ☐ Roman Catholic
- ☐ Other Christian, please write in below
- ☐ Muslim
- ☐ Buddhist
- ☐ Sikh
- ☐ Jewish
- ☐ Hindu

Another religion or body, please write in

6.2 Pagan

User need has been expressed for a Pagan tick box to be added to the religion question for the 2021 Census.

A tick box for “Pagan” is included in the religion question in the [Scottish Surveys Core Questions](#) set. The core question is asked in all Scottish Government cross-sectional surveys, including the three largest surveys in Scotland: the Scottish Household Survey (SHS); the Scottish Health Survey (SHeS); and the Scottish Crime and Justice Survey (SCJS). These questions are recommended for use in other surveys to improve comparability, reduce costs of designing surveys, to ensure participants understand what is being asked by using thoroughly tested questions, ensure outputs can be grouped in ways that are useful for analysis and reduce risk of offence when asking about sensitive subjects because the questions have been widely consulted on.

The SHS provide estimates at council area level for the population by religion of belonging. However, due to the small population size and therefore sample size of this group along with many other religious groups, data is unreliable and may not be available for analysis against other variables. It is common for data on Buddhist, Sikh, Jewish, Hindu, Pagan and other religious groups to be combined for analysis. As a result, census is the best source of information for the Pagan population.

A tick box for “Pagan” has previously been tested for the census in Scotland. A tick box was included in the [2006 Census Test](#) and [2009 Census Rehearsal](#). There were no issues with acceptability, clarity, data quality or comparability concerns with the inclusion of a tick box for “Pagan” highlighted through these tests. A response option was tested for “Pagan” because this was the most frequently written in religion response under the Other category in Scotland in 2001. A tick box was not included in the 2011 Census. As in 2001, Pagans used the write in box to specify their religion.

A tick box for “Pagan” was included in the alternative religion question included in the 2019 qualitative survey. There are no acceptability, data quality or comparability concerns about the inclusion of this tick box for the Pagan population. As such, this testing did not include a quota of Pagan participants. Testing showed that there were no acceptability, data quality or comparability concerns with the inclusion of a tick box for “Pagan” for other respondents.

6.3 Other findings

A general population sample was included in the 2019 qualitative survey to investigate whether changes impact acceptability or data quality for non-targeted groups. There was no indication of acceptability, respondent burden or data quality issues for this group with any changes in religion.

The majority of respondents to the survey did not indicate any difficulty answering questions on religion and were comfortable answering these questions. The responses of those that did have been analysed to investigate general issues with this question. Issues highlighted with the religion question related to question design. The digital first approach for 2021 requires further development and user testing to

fully understand the best way to present the questions online to maximise response, minimise respondent burden and ensure good quality data which meets user needs. Other issues related to confusion at being asked to specify a denomination, which may not be applicable to all respondents, or the complicated nature of religious identity and belief, which it is not possible to capture through a single question.

7. Next Steps

Research and analysis supports taking question changes for religion and ethnic group further at this stage.

At this stage, the following changes for the ethnic group question will be recommended to the Scottish Parliament:

- a tick box for “Roma”
- a tick box for “Showpeople” or “Showperson”
- a prompt to write in “Jewish” in the “Other ethnic group” category
- a design change to the “African” category to improve data quality
- a design change to the “Caribbean or Black” category to improve data quality

NRS will consider how ethnic group outputs can be created for some of these groups to best meet user need.

At this stage, the following changes for the religion question will be recommended to the Scottish Parliament:

- a tick box for “Pagan”
- a prompt to write in for Muslim to provide more data to meet identified user need.

It is recognised that a digital first census for 2021 provides opportunities to improve question format online in order to minimise respondent burden and therefore improve data quality. The question testing reported in our [Ethnic Group Topic Report](#) (PDF), published September 2018, focused on the development of a two stage digital design for the ethnic group question. This two stage digital design has been taken forward for further development.

The digital first approach for 2021 requires further development and user testing to fully understand the best way to present the questions online to maximise response, minimise respondent burden and ensure good quality data which meets user needs.

The final decision on the content of Scotland's Census 2021 questionnaire will be made by the Scottish Parliament.

More information about preparation for Scotland's Census 2021 and details about upcoming events can be found on the [Scotland's Census website](#), by subscribing to the [Scotland's Census newsletter](#) and following us on Twitter [@NatRecordsScot](#).

Annex A: Cognitive Focus Groups

Introduction

Focus groups were held with the Sikh community. Through assessing how participants' react to three versions of the census ethnic group question, cognitive focus groups explored:

- The acceptability of inclusion or non-inclusion of a tick box for "Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British"
- The acceptability of the placement of this tick box in the 2011 Census question
- Clarity and impacts on data quality

Background and methodology

Cognitive focus groups were held with participants from the Sikh community in Scotland, recruited with the aid of community members, charities, organisations and Gurdwaras.

Seven focus groups were conducted lasting 60 to 90 minutes across Edinburgh and Glasgow between November 2018 and January 2019, with a total of 35 participants. To further capture a range and diversity of views, participants were sampled by age and sex. The characteristics of participants are shown in Table A1.

Table A1: Cognitive Focus Group Participant Characteristics

Characteristics	Number
Sex	
Male	15
Female	20
Age	
18-34	10
35-54	9
55+	16

The aim of this research was to understand whether and why participants favoured or rejected the introduction of new response options and how they understood and rationalised answering the ethnic group question. The research was not concerned with capturing numerical data on the statistical impact of how participants responded, but instead was focused on gathering insights into opinions and behaviours surrounding the ethnic group question. This approach therefore provides an indicative picture of how people might respond and highlights any potential areas of confusion or contention.

Within each group, participants were asked to respond to the 2011 Census questions on religion, national identity and ethnic group on paper. These questions were combined in a short questionnaire that also captured information about the

characteristics of participants for sampling purposes. This questionnaire is shown in Figure A1. Following this, participants were asked to feedback on the acceptability, quality and clarity of two different designs and iterations of the ethnic group question (Figure A2) and to compare these designs with each other and the 2011 Census question. There are some limitations to this approach in terms of measuring impact on how participants would normally answer the question (as the more they discussed the question, the less 'natural' their response became).

Findings on 2011 Census questions

There were very few acceptability issues with the 2011 Census questions. A large majority of participants had no issues with any of the questions, found the questions easy to answer, familiar and felt that the options available across religion, national identity and ethnic group represented their identity.

All participants identified as Sikh in the religion question. The majority of participants selected "Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British" in ethnic group. Some participants wrote in to the ethnic group question and identified as "Scottish Sikh", "British Sikh", "Sikh Indian" or "Scottish Indian".

Some participants had difficulties answering the ethnic group question that were related to the format of this question on paper. Participants initially thought that this was multiple questions or that they were meant to provide an answer in each section. A small number of participants found the lack of a Sikh option in the ethnic group question either unacceptable or commented that "Scottish Punjabi" or "Scottish Sikh" were identities they felt were missing. These participants commented on the long history of the Sikh population in Scotland, felt that Indian was a large group and they would like to be more specific or felt that many other groups were included so they should also be included.

Findings on acceptability of a Sikh tick box in ethnic group

A large number of participants found the inclusion of a Sikh tick box acceptable. Participants were incredibly proud of their Sikh identity and expressed this while describing themselves. Many naturally identified as "Scottish Sikh" or "British Sikh". Those that preferred the inclusion of a tick box for "Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British" felt that this more accurately represented their identity, allowed them to be more specific about their Indian background and found it easier to locate their response to the ethnic group question. Many participants described gravitating more naturally towards this box because this is a strong element of their identity.

Some participants had no issues with the inclusion of a Sikh tick box but indicated that they would not select a Sikh tick box and would identify as "Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British". Younger participants generally found the tick box less acceptable and were more likely to identify strongly as Scottish or British.

There were some strong acceptability issues with the inclusion of a Sikh tick box. Some participants found the inclusion of religion under ethnic group unacceptable and confusing. These participants found the questions including a Sikh tick box more difficult to answer because they were now unsure of what they were being asked for. Other participants were very clear that they felt religion and ethnic group should be separated or that this was repetitive since they had already selected Sikh in the religion question. Some participants who felt that the inclusion of a religious identity was confusing or inappropriate also found it difficult to select another option because this felt they were having to 'turn their back on' their Sikh identity.

Many participants with varying views on the inclusion of a tick box questioned why Sikh was the only religion included. Some questioned why they were being singled out and many commented on why other major religions in India were not included, particularly when discussing a version of the question with Sikh placed under the Asian category. Some participants felt that if Sikh were to be included all the religions from the religion question should be included, the two questions should be merged into one question or the wording of the ethnic group question should be changed to make it clear that this included ethnic and religious identity.

There were mixed findings on the placement of a Sikh tick box in the ethnic group question. There were acceptability issues with placement both under “Other ethnic group” and “Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British”. Many participants who indicated they would select a Sikh tick box felt that they would select this box irrespective of its placement in the question. Some participants found it unacceptable to be included under “Other ethnic group” and found this “hurtful”, as though they “do not have an identity” or were being given less recognition than other ethnic groups in Scotland. Some participants questioned why the tick box was not included under Asian. Many participants found the tick box easier to locate when it was included under Asian, and many preferred the inclusion under Asian for this reason. Inclusion under Asian raised more concerns about the lack of inclusion of other religions, was found by some respondents to be confusing because this did not “fit” with the geographical options provided under Asian and was thought to be less inclusive by excluding Sikhs who do not identify as Asian.


Participants were asked which version of the ethnic group question they preferred, the 2011 question, version A (Sikh tick box under “Other ethnic group”) or version B (Sikh tick box under Asian). Overall, there was no clear question preference. Those who preferred version B preferred the inclusion of a tick box and found this version easiest to answer. Those who preferred A preferred the inclusion of a tick box and found this version most inclusive or appropriate. Some preferred A or B largely because they included more ethnic groups than the 2011 question. Some participants preferred the 2011 Census question. A large number of participants had no preference and found all questions acceptable.

Findings on clarity and data quality

A large number of participants indicated they would select a tick box for “Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British”. Other participants indicated that they would not select this if it was included. A tick box under ethnic group may therefore undercount the Sikh population in Scotland.

Among participants that indicated they would select a Sikh tick box, some multi-ticked with “Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British”, suggesting an increase in data quality issues and reduced clarity of the question. A few participants did not initially notice that a Sikh tick box was included and went back and changed their answer when this was highlighted, indicating that there may be some respondents who answer differently because they do not locate this tick box.

Figure A1: Cognitive Focus Group Questionnaire

Scotland's Census 2021 – Question Testing					 Scotland's Census <small>Shaping our future</small>	
<p>1 What is your age?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> 18 – 34 years</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> 35 – 54 years</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> 55+ years</p>						
<p>2 What is your sex?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Male</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Female</p>						
<p>3 Which of the following best describes your household?</p> <p>♦ Tick one box only</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Single person household</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Lone parent household with children</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Couple household without children</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Couple household with children</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other – without children</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other – with children</p>						
<p>4 What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?</p> <p>♦ This question is voluntary</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> None</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Church of Scotland</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Roman Catholic</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other Christian, please write in below</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Muslim</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Hindu</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Buddhist</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Sikh</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Jewish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Another religion or body, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>5 What do you feel is your national identity?</p> <p>♦ Tick all that apply</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Scottish <input type="checkbox"/> English <input type="checkbox"/> Northern Irish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Welsh <input type="checkbox"/> British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>6 What is your ethnic group?</p> <p>♦ Choose ONE section from A to F, then tick ONE box which best describes your ethnic group or background</p>						
<p>A White</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Scottish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Irish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Gypsy / Traveller</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Polish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other white ethnic group, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>B Mixed or multiple ethnic groups</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Any mixed or multiple ethnic groups, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>C Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>D African</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> African, African Scottish or African British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>E Caribbean or Black</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Black, Black Scottish or Black British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>						
<p>F Other ethnic group</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>						

Thank you for your participation.

Figure A2: Cognitive Focus Group Alternative Ethnic Group questions

Version A	Version B
<p>What is your ethnic group? ♦ Choose ONE section from A to F, then tick ONE box which best describes your ethnic group or background</p> <p>A White</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Scottish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Irish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Gypsy / Traveller</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Roma</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Showpeople</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Polish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other white ethnic group, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>B Mixed or multiple ethnic groups</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Any mixed or multiple ethnic groups, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>C Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>D African</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> African, African Scottish or African British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>E Caribbean or Black</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Black, Black Scottish or Black British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>F Other ethnic group</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Jewish, Jewish Scottish or Jewish British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>	<p>What is your ethnic group? ♦ Choose ONE section from A to F, then tick ONE box which best describes your ethnic group or background</p> <p>A White</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Scottish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Irish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Gypsy / Traveller</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Roma</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Showpeople</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Polish</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other white ethnic group, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>B Mixed or multiple ethnic groups</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Any mixed or multiple ethnic groups, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>C Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>D African</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> African, African Scottish or African British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>E Caribbean or Black</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Black, Black Scottish or Black British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p> <p>F Other ethnic group</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Jewish, Jewish Scottish or Jewish British</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other, please write in</p> <p>_____</p>

Annex B: 2019 Qualitative Survey Test

Introduction

A qualitative online survey was undertaken to test potential changes to the religion and ethnic group questions for inclusion in Scotland's Census 2021.

The main aims of this qualitative survey test were to explore:

- Responses to the 2011 Census questions and the alternative questions to gain insights into acceptability, clarity and data quality
- Acceptability through feedback and preferences
- Clarity and data quality

Background and methodology

The qualitative online survey asked participants two different versions of a religion question and two different versions of an ethnic group question, as well as a number of questions for analysis and sampling purposes. These questions are shown in [Annex C](#).

The purpose of this qualitative survey was to test potential changes to the religion and ethnic group questions for Muslim, African, Caribbean or Black, Roma, Jewish and Sikh, with people from these groups. The survey was promoted to people from these populations with the aid of community members, charities, organisations and places of worship across Scotland to capture a range and diversity of views. Participants were also encouraged through the text accompanying the survey to share it with other people who may wish to participate. This is sometimes known as a 'snow-ball' method of testing. The survey also had a general population sample, recruited through the same method and also by NRS, to investigate whether changes impact acceptability or data quality for non-targeted groups.

A two-stage ethnic group question was developed in 2017 to improve the online user experience of this question. The 2019 qualitative testing survey included the online version of the 2011 Census ethnic group question developed in 2017 as a comparison for the alternative online ethnic group question to ensure that changes in response, comments and preferences are related to the changes of interest (for example, the inclusion of a tick box) and do not result from changes in format.

The survey was conducted online between 11 January and 8 February 2019. It was further extended to 18 February and additional promotional activities were undertaken to increase the response rate for some groups.

These methods of recruiting participants are particularly useful to gain larger number of responses from specific groups than in cognitive interview testing. The research was not concerned with capturing numerical data on the statistical impact of how participants responded, but instead was focused on gathering insights into changes in response, acceptability and issues with design or language that may impact data quality. This approach therefore provides an indicative picture of how people might respond and highlights any potential areas of confusion or contention.

In total there were 362 responses to the qualitative online survey, of which 329 were valid and included for analysis. To be considered a valid response for analysis purposes, a respondent was required to provide as a minimum, responses to age group, sex and either both ethnic group questions or one ethnic group question and a feedback question. Religion is not included in this definition for valid responses because the question is voluntary. Questions that were included in the survey for analysis purposes were used to identify and remove duplicate responses where possible.

Respondent characteristics for valid responses are included in Table B1.

Table B1: Qualitative Online Survey Respondent Characteristics

Characteristics	Number
Sex	
Male	158
Female	171
Age	
18 - 24	40
25 - 34	37
35 - 44	62
45 - 54	78
55 - 64	67
65 - 74	37
75 and over	8
Highest Qualification	
Further or higher education (for example, degree, masters, PhD, professional qualifications, SVQ level 5)	225
Upper secondary school qualification (for example, Higher, A Level) or above	38
Lower secondary school qualification (for example, Standard Grade, Intermediate 1 or 2, O Grade, GSCE, National 4 or 5) or below	31
No qualifications	35
Group*	
Jewish	80
Sikh	22
African	59
Caribbean or Black	2
Showpeople	71
Muslim	49
Roma	6
General Population	43

Characteristics	Number
Household composition	
Couple household with children	155
Couple household without children	80
Lone parent household with children	19
Other - with children	14
Other - without children	16
Single person household	45
Health Board area	
Ayrshire and Arran, Borders, Dumfries and Galloway, and Lanarkshire	31
Greater Glasgow and Clyde	122
Lothian	106
Fife, Forth Valley, and Tayside	24
Grampian	28
Highland, Western Isles, Orkney, Shetland, and unknown	18

* Note that it is possible for respondents to be part of more than one group. Groups have been estimated using responses to both ethnic group and religion.

African ethnic groups

There were 59 African respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey by ethnic group. A large majority of these respondents were born in Africa.

Findings on acceptability: African

Almost all African respondents went on to provide an answer to the alternative ethnic group question, and provided a write in response. There was no indication by response rate that the alternative question is less acceptable than the 2011 Census question.

Similar numbers of respondents indicated that they had difficulty answering each ethnic group question. A few responses indicated that the alternative version of the ethnic group question was more straightforward, and a number of comments indicated that there was some confusion about how to respond for respondents with multiple identities. Census question guidance was not included in this test, and this additional guidance may resolve difficulties that respondents with multiple African ethnic groups had with the alternative question. There was no indication of acceptability issues with the alternative design compared to the question with 2011 Census response options.

Respondents were asked why they preferred a particular question. Respondents who provided a reason for having no preference largely commented that they had not noticed a difference. Respondents who preferred the alternative ethnic group question indicated that they preferred that this version allowed them to be more specific about their identity or felt that it was easier to answer. Respondents who preferred the question with 2011 Census response options indicated that this was easier to answer, for example that they didn't "have to think of the answer", preferred

to identify as “African”, or preferred that this included “African Scottish” and “African British”.

More respondents who expressed a question preference preferred the alternative question (39% compared to 14%, a further 42% expressed no preference), indicating that there are no acceptability issues with this design compared to the question with 2011 Census response options.

Many comments included reference to Scottish or British identity. Including this language in this category may further increase the acceptability of the alternative ethnic group question.

Findings on clarity and data quality: African

In the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options, the majority of African respondents selected the tick box for “African, African Scottish or African British” (78%). All those who selected “Other, please enter” provided a written response. Of the write ins, 12% included “African” (excluding ‘South African’). The write ins to this question are listed in Table B2.

Table B2: Responses to ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options

African ethnic group	Number
Tick box response (African, African Scottish or African British)	46
Write ins (including African, African Asian, African French, African Scottish, Black African, Ghanaian, Kenyan, Nigerian, Nilo-Saharan-Southern Nilotic African, Zambian British)	13
Total	59

Of respondents to the alternative ethnic group question, almost all African respondents provided a written response (98%). Of these write ins, 5% included “African” (excluding ‘South African’). Most write ins provided nationality or country of origin information, a small number included other types of African ethnic group. A small number of respondents provided multiple African ethnic groups. These responses are shown in Table B3.

The increased number of write ins in the alternative question, providing detailed African ethnic group data, improves data quality to meet user need compared to the 2011 response options. The reduction in the number of written responses including “African” also suggests an improvement in data quality of write in information to meet user need for more detailed data in the alternative question compared to the ethnic group question with 2011 response options.

Table B3: Responses to alternative ethnic group question

African ethnic group	Number
Kenyan (including Kenyan Luo)	18
Nigerian	17
Zimbabwean	4
Ghanaian	3
Ugandan (including Ugandan, Muganda)	3
Other write ins (including Malawian, Botswana, Senegal and Gambia, Southern African, Sudanese, Tanzanian, Zambian, African Asian and East African)	11
Non-response	3
Total	59

Findings on comparability: African

Data collected through the alternative ethnic group question for African is expected to be comparable at category level with information collected through the 2011 Census question level. Testing did not indicate that respondents were likely to change how they approached the high level categories in the ethnic group question. Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK. The ONS have also recommended that for 2021, the ethnic group question in England and Wales should include an option for those selecting “African” within the “Black, African, Caribbean or Black British” category to write in a more specific ethnic background, providing for the collection of comparable data.

Caribbean or Black ethnic groups

Results: Caribbean or Black

There were two Caribbean or Black respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey by ethnic group. Both respondents provided a written response to the alternative ethnic group question. Respondents indicated that they did not find any of the questions difficult to answer, and indicated no question preferences. No comments or feedback was provided. There was no indication that the alternative question is less acceptable than the 2011 Census question. Data collected through the alternative ethnic group question for Caribbean or Black is expected to be comparable at category level with information collected through the 2011 Census question level. Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

Roma ethnic group

There were six Roma respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey by ethnic group.

Findings on acceptability: Roma

A slightly larger number of respondents indicated that they had difficulty answering the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options, and the majority of Roma respondents preferred the alternative question, indicating that the alternative design is more acceptable than the question with 2011 Census response options.

The majority of respondents selected the “Roma” tick box in the alternative ethnic group question, indicating a general acceptability for the inclusion and location of this tick box. In feedback, the location of this box was questioned, indicating that there may be some acceptability issues about placement for some respondents.

Findings on clarity and data quality: Roma

The majority of respondents selected the “Roma” tick box in the alternative ethnic group question. All respondents either selected “Roma” or entered a write in response that included “Roma”. This increases the data quality to meet the user need to identify this group separately. In the question with 2011 Census response options, half of the respondents could be identified as Roma.

Although the alternative question improved data quality to meet user need, not all respondents chose to select the “Roma” tick box. The location of the “Roma” tick box under “White” was questioned. While the location of the tick box has been shown to improve data quality, be generally acceptable, and easy to locate, NRS will continue to work with data users to consider how ethnic group outputs can be created to best meet user need.

Findings on comparability: Roma

Data collected through the alternative ethnic group question is expected to be acceptably comparable at category level with information collected through the 2011 Census question. Testing indicates that some respondents may choose to select the “White” high level category, who would not have chosen this category in the 2011 question. The number of respondents who are likely to select a different category is expected to be negligible compared to the category sizes.

Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK. The ONS have also recommended that for 2021, the ethnic group question in England and Wales should include a tick-box for “Roma” within the “White” category under “Gypsy or Irish Traveller”, providing for the collection of comparable data on Roma.

Showpeople ethnic group

Results: Showpeople

There were 71 Showpeople respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey by ethnic group. A large majority of these respondents were born in Scotland.

Findings on acceptability: Showpeople

All Showpeople respondents identifiable by ethnic group answered both ethnic group questions. There was no indication by response rate that the alternative question is less acceptable than the 2011 Census question.

In the alternative ethnic group question the majority of respondents (90%) selected the tick box for “Showpeople”, indicating high acceptability for this tick box.

Respondents who wrote in to the alternative question wrote in responses that could be used to identify them as Showpeople. Feedback indicated that some respondents may not have located the tick box in the alternative question. It is also possible that some respondents may have wanted to identify more specifically as a Showman, or show affiliation with the Scottish Showmen’s Guild. Many write ins across the ethnic group questions in this test were for “Showman” or “Showperson” rather than “Showpeople”. A tick box for “Showperson” rather than “Showpeople” may improve both acceptability and data quality.

A smaller number of Showpeople respondents indicated difficulties with the alternative ethnic group question (7% compared to 38% who had difficulty answering the question with 2011 Census response options). A large number of comments on the question with 2011 Census response options related to the lack of inclusion of Showpeople in the question, that “Gypsy / Traveller” is too broad a group, expressed that the respondent did not identify with “Gypsy / Traveller” or that these terms were unacceptable. These were generally resolved by the inclusion of the tick box in the alternative question.

Of Showpeople respondents, a large majority (80%) preferred the alternative ethnic group question. Feedback was positive about the inclusion of a tick box for “Showpeople”, further indicating the acceptability of this tick box among this group.

Findings on clarity and data quality: Showpeople

In the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options, the majority of Showpeople respondents selected a response option under the “White” category (92%). Of the respondents who selected “White”, most went on to write in a response to “Other white ethnic group...” (65%), 22% selected the tick box “Scottish” and 11% selected the tick box “Gypsy / Traveller”. Those who wrote in did not do so consistently, a range of terms were used that could be considered to be under the “Showpeople” umbrella, for example, Showman, Show woman. “Showman” was the most common write in, accounting for 45% of the write-ins to “Other white ethnic group”.

The remaining Showpeople respondents selected “Other ethnic group” (8%) in the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options. These respondents all provided a write in response, but also did not write in consistently.

In the alternative ethnic group question 99% of respondents selected the “White” category. Of these, 90% selected the tick box for “Showpeople”, 6% selected “Other white ethnic group...” and 4% selected “Scottish”. Those who selected “Other white ethnic group...” also provided write in responses that could identify them as Showpeople, but did not write in consistently. A small number of respondents that indicated they had difficulty with the alternative question commented that their ethnic group was not included. These participants may have wanted to be more specific

about their ethnic group than “Showpeople” or may have missed that this option was included.

A larger proportion of this population could be identified as Showpeople through the alternative ethnic group question, indicating improved data quality to meet user need. Combining responses across ethnic group categories, and allowing for variations in write-in responses (for example, Showman, Show woman, Showperson, Travelling Showmen, Fairground Traveller), 68% of the Showpeople respondents could be identified as belonging to this group through the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options. In the alternative question this increased to 96%.

While the location of the tick box has been shown to improve data quality, be highly acceptable, and generally easy to locate, NRS will continue to work with data users to consider how ethnic group outputs can be created to best meet user need.

Findings on comparability: Showpeople

Data collected through the alternative ethnic group question is expected to be acceptably comparable at category level with information collected through the 2011 Census question level. Testing indicates that some respondents may choose to select the “White” high level category, who would not have chosen this category in the 2011 question. The number of respondents who are likely to select a different category is expected to be negligible compared to the category sizes.

Comparability at category level will also allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

Jewish ethnic group

Results: Jewish

There were 80 Jewish respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey, combining responses to religion and ethnic group.

A small majority of Jewish respondents were born in Scotland (38%), a further 33% were born in England and 26% were born outside of the UK and Republic of Ireland.

Findings on acceptability: Jewish

The majority of Jewish respondents answered both ethnic group questions. There was no indication by response rate that the alternative question is less acceptable than the 2011 Census question.

In the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options, 64% of Jewish respondents selected a response option under the “White” category and 28% selected “Other ethnic group”. Those who wrote in did not do so consistently and did not necessarily write in a response including “Jewish”. Many included a nationality as well as “Jew” or “Jewish”, or entered their nationality or country of origin as their only ethnic identity.

In the alternative question, a tick box for “Jewish, Jewish Scottish or Jewish British” was included under “Other ethnic group”. In the alternative question, 69% of respondents selected “Other ethnic group” and 25% selected “White”. Some Jewish respondents continued to identify locations in the ethnic group question including ‘White: Scottish’, ‘White: Other British’ and ‘Mixed or multiple ethnic groups’.

indicating that the tick box and/or location of the tick box may be unacceptable, not thought most appropriate or was not located by all Jewish respondents.

The number of Jewish respondents reporting difficulty with the ethnic group question was reduced for the alternative question, from 54% to 23%.

Respondents who indicated that they had difficulty answering the religion questions and the ethnic group question with 2011 Census response options commented that they identify ethnically, culturally or racially as Jewish, hold secular or other non-Jewish beliefs or do not practice Judaism, or referred to the lack of an option for “Jewish” in this ethnic group question.

Many respondents did not indicate any difficulties with changing their response and the location of their response in the alternative question. However, feedback from some respondents indicates that there are some acceptability issues with including this tick box under the “Other ethnic group category” and that some respondents may not select this box in this location.

The majority of these comments were related to the inclusion of a Jewish tick box and its placement. Some respondents identified as both white and Jewish (with or without also a nationality) and had difficulties relating to the placement of this tick box under “Other ethnic group”. In contrast, feedback elsewhere indicated that some respondents did not identify as white and were pleased with the placement of the tick box. A smaller number of respondents did not identify with the language in the tick box and wished to be more specific about their identity. Some respondents commented that they did not think Jewish was an ethnic group or that they were surprised to find religion as part of a definition of ethnic group.

The majority of Jewish respondents preferred the alternative ethnic group question (63%, compared to 9% for the question with 2011 Census response options), indicating that this version of the question was acceptable to many respondents. Feedback from these respondents was generally positive about the inclusion of Jewish.

Findings on clarity and data quality: Jewish

The primary data quality concern is whether the Jewish population is undercounted by using the religion question as a proxy for the whole Jewish population.

Combining responses from tick box and write in responses across ethnic group categories, a larger proportion of the Jewish population could be identified as Jewish through the alternative ethnic group question (79% compared to 58%). Fewer respondents indicated difficulties with the alternative question, and the majority preferred the alternative question. Many found the alternative question easier to answer. The alternative question is therefore likely to provide higher quality data on the Jewish population as a whole than the question with 2011 Census response options.

In this test, eight respondents (10%) identified as Jewish only by ethnic group. Some respondents changed their answers between questions, but similar numbers identified as ethnically Jewish only in each ethnic group question (six in the question with 2011 Census response options and seven in the alternative question).

There is little indication from this test that the inclusion of a tick box for Jewish would result in an increased identification of the Jewish population that identify ethnically

only above using write in responses to a question with 2011 Census response options.

A smaller proportion of the total Jewish population in the test could be estimated using an ethnic group question (58% or 79%) compared to a religion question (88% or 89%). This smaller coverage is related to acceptability issues with the tick box and/or location, that this option may not be thought most appropriate for all respondents in ethnic group, and because some respondents may not have located the tick box. There is a risk that if data from ethnic group was used alone, this figure would undercount the Jewish population.

These results indicate that the best estimation of the Jewish population is likely to be the estimate obtained from the religion question (around 90%) plus those who identify ethnically only by responses across ethnic group categories (around 10%), whether this is collected from a question having a tick box response for Jewish or not. NRS will continue to work with data users to consider how ethnic group outputs can be created to best meet user need.

Findings on comparability: Jewish

Testing indicates that respondents may choose to select the “Other ethnic group” high level category, who would not have chosen this category in the 2011 question. The number of respondents who are likely to select a different category is expected to be negligible compared to the “White” category size but may impact the size of the “Other ethnic group” category. Acceptably comparable category level data over time would be achievable by aggregating Jewish responses under “Other ethnic group” with the “White” category (see Scotland’s Census 2011 Ethnic Group by Religion in [Annex D](#)).

Acceptable comparability at category level, which might be achieved by aggregating different groups, would allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

Sikh ethnic group

Results: Sikh

There were 22 Sikh respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey, combining responses to religion and ethnic group. All of these respondents identified as religiously Sikh. The majority of Sikh respondents were born in Scotland (59%).

Findings on acceptability: Sikh

The majority of Sikh respondents answered both ethnic group questions. There was no indication by response rate that the alternative question is less acceptable than the 2011 Census question.

Fewer participants indicated difficulty answering the alternative question (4 compared to 11 who indicated difficulty with the question with 2011 Census response options), and more respondents preferred this version (13 of the 22 respondents).

The lack of a Sikh option was the most common reason for difficulty, and the inclusion of Sikh the most common reason for preferring the alternative question. Few respondents provided a reason for having difficulty with the alternative ethnic

group question, those that did felt that that Sikh should not be under “Other ethnic group”.

Overall, the inclusion of Sikh was largely acceptable. The placement of a Sikh option under “Other ethnic group” was mostly acceptable, but caused difficulty for some respondents.

Findings on clarity and data quality: Sikh

The primary data quality concern is whether the Sikh population is undercounted by using the religion question as a proxy for the whole Sikh population.

Combining tick box and write in responses across ethnic group categories, a larger proportion of the Sikh population could be identified as Sikh through the alternative ethnic group question (73% compared to 50% in the question with 2011 Census response options). However, the religion question was found to provide the best information on the Sikh population (100% coverage).

There is no indication from this test that the religion question undercounts the Sikh population. There is a risk that if data from ethnic group was used alone, this figure would undercount the Sikh population.

Findings on comparability: Sikh

Testing indicates that respondents may choose to select the “Other ethnic group” high level category, who would not have chosen this category in the 2011 question. The number of respondents who are likely to select a different category is expected to be negligible compared to the Asian category size but may impact the size of the “Other ethnic group” category. Acceptable comparability at category level would be achieved with a Sikh tick box under the Asian category. Comparable category level data would otherwise be achievable by aggregating a Sikh tick box under “Other ethnic group” with the Asian category (see Scotland’s Census 2011 Ethnic Group by Religion in [Annex D](#)).

Acceptable comparability at category level, which might be achieved by aggregating different groups, would allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

Muslim religion

Results: Muslim

There were 49 Muslim respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey, by religion. Of Muslim respondents, the majority were born in the UK (61%).

The alternative religion question was included before the 2011 Census religion question to ensure that respondents did not ‘learn’ to tick a box for Muslim and reduce their likelihood to write in to a second question that included a prompt.

Findings on acceptability: Muslim

All Muslim respondents answered both religion questions. The majority of respondents indicated no difficulty with either question. There was no indication by response rate or difficulty that the alternative question is less acceptable than the 2011 Census question.

Respondents who indicated they had difficulty with these questions expressed their wish to identify with their Muslim group, commented on their group not being

included or that they would prefer this to be a tick box, were unsure about what to write in as they had already ticked “Muslim” or made general comments about the religion question and data. Similar comments were made about both religion questions.

More respondents preferred the alternative question (22%) compared to the 2011 Census question (6%), indicating that this question is more acceptable. Those that preferred the alternative question preferred that this allowed them to add their denomination or sect and still be categorised as Muslim and that this question gave more recognition to different types of religions.

Findings on clarity and data quality: Muslim

The majority of respondents wrote in and further specified their religious group in the alternative question (78%). Of all Muslim respondents, 67% identified as Shia, 18% did not write in, 4% identified as Sunni and the remaining respondents identified as “Muslim”, as another Muslim group, or included “Shia” and “Sunni” along with further specification.

The majority of respondents indicated no difficulty with this question. It is unclear whether those who did not write in did not wish to write in, did not notice they could write in or were unsure what to write in. For those who did write in but did not specify a denomination, their responses and feedback indicate a mix of reasons for not specifying a denomination.

A large number of respondents wrote in a response to the 2011 Census religion question (67%), with or without ticking the box for “Muslim”. This is largely thought to be the result of learned behaviour where these participants anticipated writing in, in the same way as they responded to the alternative question.

Findings on comparability: Muslim

Data collected through the alternative religion question is expected to be comparable at category level (“Muslim”) with information collected through the 2011 Census question level. Comparability at category level would allow for harmonisation with census statistics across the UK.

General Population

Results: General Population

There were 43 general population respondents to the 2019 qualitative online survey. The majority of these respondents were born in Scotland (74%).

Findings on acceptability: General Population

There was no indication that any of the changes in the ethnic group and religion questions resulted in any changes in acceptability for the general population.

The majority of these respondents did not identify any difficulty answering any of the questions. The percentage of general population respondents expressing difficulty answering each question is shown in Table B5. No feedback was related to any of the changes made in the alternative questions.

Table B4: Responses to alternative ethnic group question

Difficult to answer	Percentage
Alternative religion question (set 1)	7%
2011 religion question (set 2)	12%
National Identity question (set 1)	19%
National Identity question (set 2) (note there was no difference between national identity questions)	7%
Ethnic group (2011 Census response options) (set 1)	9%
Alternative ethnic group question (set 2)	16%
Did not find any of these questions difficult (set 1)	67%
Did not find any of these questions difficult (set 2)	51%

Respondents were asked which religion and ethnic group questions they preferred. Among the general population sample there was no clear preference for a particular ethnic group or religion question.

Findings on clarity, data quality and comparability: General Population

There was little indication of respondents changing their responses between the 2011 and alternative questions, indicating that these changes do not impact the data quality provided by other respondents. As a result, there are no comparability concerns for these respondents.

Other findings

Some respondents to the 2019 qualitative survey reported other issues with the questions on religion, national identity and ethnic group. This section reports on these other findings.

Although this section investigates issues with these questions, the majority of respondents did not indicate that they had difficulty answering these questions. Many respondents commented that they were comfortable answering questions about their identity and didn't see the questions as intrusive.

Respondents who indicated they had difficulty answering a religion question commented on:

- the complexity of their relationship with multiple Christian denominations, churches or multiple faiths,
- confusion at being asked to write in 'other Christian' denominations into "Another religion or body"
- confusion at being asked to specify more than "Christian" or questioned why this information was being collected
- wanting to specify a belief rather than an 'organised' religion
- the "disconnect between religious belief and cultural and community religious practice" that is not captured in this question
- a preference to identify as "Catholic" rather than "Roman Catholic"

Respondents who indicated difficulty answering the national identity question commented on:

- a lack of options to express non-UK national identities
- general confusion about this question and whether national identity relates to citizenship, nationality or the nation one lives in

In addition, a number of respondents commented that they wanted to identify more than one national identity. It is possible these respondents missed that it was possible to select more than one option in this question.

Respondents who indicated difficulty answering the ethnic group question commented on:

- concern that they might not get to further specify their ethnic group at stage one of the ethnic group question (the higher level categories),
- colour terminology, with a few respondents finding “Black” unacceptable, all language using colour unacceptable or inappropriate in a question asking about “ethnicity” or finding the use of colour confusing and difficulty with choosing where to respond in the question
- the complicated nature of identity and that complicated and mixed personal and family history make it difficult to answer the question, or that it was not clear what was meant by “ethnic group”
- “Other British” not feeling an accurate enough description, or wanting to identify specifically as “British”
- a wish to be able to select more than one option in this question
- confusion with African and Caribbean being separate groups or the lack of an “African Caribbean” option

In addition, a few respondents questioned why data was being collected about religion, national identity and ethnic group, and referenced ethnic cleansing, stereotypes, political issues. Others said they did not like to be “categorised” or felt that they were “*being boxed*”, asked to select options being prescribed to them rather than being able to identify naturally or found that the questions made them feel excluded or “*like a foreigner*”.

Design of stage one of the ethnic group question

A different design for stage one of the ethnic group question was tested in the alternative question. Some prompts for groups were removed from text indicating ethnic groups that would be included in the second stages and prompts for new groups were added. There was no indication that this resulted in any issues for the groups that were removed from the prompts.

Annex C: 2019 Qualitative Survey Questions

The figures below show the questions included in the NRS 2019 Qualitative Survey Test for ethnic group and religion. These figures show the survey questions in the order they appeared in the survey.

Analysis variables: About your household

1. How many people usually live in your household?

- Please include yourself and **all** other adults and children

- ☐ 1
- ☐ 2
- ☐ 3
- ☐ 4
- ☐ 5
- ☐ 6 or more

2. Which of the following best describes your household?

- ☐ Single person household
- ☐ Lone parent household with children
- ☐ Couple household without children
- ☐ Couple household with children
- ☐ Other - without children
- ☐ Other - with children

3. Please enter your home postcode:

- This information will be used to ensure we have a fair representation of people from across Scotland

Analysis variables: Age and sex

4. What is your age?

- ☐ 18 - 24
- ☐ 25 - 34
- ☐ 35 - 44
- ☐ 45 - 54
- ☐ 55 - 64
- ☐ 65 - 74
- ☐ 75 and over

5. What is your sex?

- ☐ Female
- ☐ Male

Analysis variables: Country of birth

6. What is your country of birth?

- ☐ Scotland
- ☐ England
- ☐ Northern Ireland
- ☐ Wales
- ☐ Republic of Ireland
- ☐ Elsewhere, please enter current name of the country

Analysis variables: Highest qualification

7. What is your highest qualification?

- ☐ Lower secondary school qualification (for example, Standard Grade, Intermediate 1 or 2, O Grade, GSCE, National 4 or 5) or below
- ☐ Upper secondary school qualification (for example, Higher, A Level) or above
- ☐ Further or higher education (for example, degree, masters, PhD, professional qualifications, SVQ level 5)
- ☐ No qualifications

Alternative religion question

8. What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?

- This question is voluntary

- ☐ None
- ☐ Church of Scotland
- ☐ Roman Catholic
- ☐ Other Christian, please write in below
- ☐ Muslim, please write in below
- ☐ Buddhist
- ☐ Sikh
- ☐ Jewish
- ☐ Hindu
- ☐ Pagan

Another religion or body, please write in

2011 Census national identity question

9. What do you feel is your national identity?

- ☐ Scottish
- ☐ English
- ☐ Northern Irish
- ☐ Welsh
- ☐ British
- ☐ Other, please enter:

2017 Ethnic group question (2011 Census response options)

Ethnic group stage 1

10. What is your ethnic group?

- Select **one** only
- The next question asks about your ethnic group in more detail

- ☐ **White**
(including any white ethnic group)
- ☐ **Mixed or multiple ethnic groups**
(including any mixed or multiple ethnic groups)
- ☐ **Asian**
(including Pakistani, Indian, Bangladeshi, Chinese or any other Asian ethnic group)
- ☐ **African**
(including African, African Scottish, African British or any other African ethnic group)
- ☐ **Caribbean or Black**
(including Caribbean, Black or any other Caribbean or Black ethnic group)
- ☐ **Other ethnic group**
(including Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British, or any other ethnic group)

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = "White")

11. Which one best describes your white ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

- ☐ Scottish
- ☐ Other British
- ☐ Irish
- ☐ Gypsy / Traveller
- ☐ Polish
- ☐ Other white ethnic group, please enter:

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = "Mixed or multiple ethnic groups")

12. Please enter your mixed or multiple ethnic groups:

i.

ii.

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = "Asian")

13. Which one best describes your Asian ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

- ☐ Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British
- ☐ Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British
- ☐ Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British
- ☐ Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British
- ☐ Other, please enter:

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “African”)

14. Which one best describes your African ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

☐ African, African Scottish or African British

☐ Other, please enter:

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “Caribbean or Black”)

15. Which one best describes your Caribbean or Black ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

☐ Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British

☐ Black, Black Scottish or Black British

☐ Other, please enter:

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “Other ethnic group”)

16. Which one best describes your other ethnic group or background?

- Select one only

☐ Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British

☐ Other, please enter:

Feedback questions

17. Please give us feedback on these questions before continuing to the next set of questions.

Did you find any of these questions difficult to answer?

- Select **all** that apply

- ☐ Religion
- ☐ National identity
- ☐ Ethnic group
- ☐ I did not find any of these questions difficult

18. For the options you selected, please tell us why:

Please start your comment with the name of the question, for example

"Religion..."

2011 Census religion

19. What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to?

- This question is voluntary

- ☐ None
- ☐ Church of Scotland
- ☐ Roman Catholic
- ☐ Other Christian, please write in below
- ☐ Muslim
- ☐ Buddhist
- ☐ Sikh
- ☐ Jewish
- ☐ Hindu

Another religion or body, please write in

2011 Census national identity question

9. What do you feel is your national identity?

- ☐ Scottish
- ☐ English
- ☐ Northern Irish
- ☐ Welsh
- ☐ British
- ☐ Other, please enter:

2017 Ethnic group question (2011 Census response options)

Ethnic group stage 1

21. What is your ethnic group?

- Select **one** only
- The next question asks about your ethnic group in more detail

- ☐ **White**
(including Gypsy, Traveller, Roma, Showpeople)
- ☐ **Mixed or multiple ethnic groups**
(including any mixed or multiple ethnic groups)
- ☐ **Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British**
(including any Asian ethnic group)
- ☐ **African**
(including any African ethnic group)
- ☐ **Caribbean or Black**
(including any Caribbean or Black ethnic group)
- ☐ **Other ethnic group**
(any other ethnic group, including Arab, Jewish, Sikh)

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = "White")

22. Which one best describes your white ethnic group or background?

- Select **one** only

- ☐ Scottish
- ☐ Other British
- ☐ Irish
- ☐ Gypsy / Traveller
- ☐ Roma
- ☐ Showpeople
- ☐ Polish
- ☐ Other white ethnic group, please enter:

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “Mixed or multiple ethnic groups”)

23. Please enter your mixed or multiple ethnic groups:

i.

ii.

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British”)

24. Which one best describes your Asian ethnic group or background?

• **Select one only**

- ☐ Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British
- ☐ Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British
- ☐ Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British
- ☐ Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British
- ☐ Other, please enter:

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “African”)

25. Please enter your African ethnic group or background (for example, Nigerian, Somali)

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = “Caribbean or Black”)

26. Please enter your Caribbean or Black ethnic group or background (for example, Caribbean Scottish, Black Scottish)

Ethnic group stage 2 (where stage 1 = "Other ethnic group")

27. Which one best describes your other ethnic group or background?

- Select **one** only

- ☐ Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British
- ☐ Sikh, Sikh Scottish or Sikh British
- ☐ Jewish, Jewish Scottish or Jewish British
- ☐ Other, please enter:

Feedback questions

28. Please give us feedback on these questions before continuing to the next set of questions.

Did you find any of these questions difficult to answer?

- Select **all** that apply

- ☐ Religion
- ☐ National identity
- ☐ Ethnic group
- ☐ I did not find any of these questions difficult

29. For the options you selected, please tell us why:

Please start your comment with the name of the question, for example

"Religion..."

Feedback questions

You were shown two slightly different **ethnic group** questions.

There were only differences in some categories, so you may or may not have noticed a difference.

30. Which ethnic group question did you prefer?

- ☐ The first question
- ☐ The second question
- ☐ No preference

31. Why did you prefer this question?

Feedback questions

You were shown two slightly different **religion** group questions.

There were only differences in some categories, so you may or may not have noticed a difference.

32. Which religion question did you prefer?

- ☐ The first question
- ☐ The second question
- ☐ No preference

33. Why did you prefer this question?

Annex D: Scotland's Census 2011 Ethnic Group by Religion

Religion	All people	Church of Scotland	Roman Catholic	Other Christian	Buddhist	Hindu	Jewish	Muslim	Sikh	Other religion	No religion	Religion not stated
Ethnicity												
All people	5295403	1717871	841053	291275	12795	16379	5887	76737	9055	15196	1941116	368039
White: Total	5084407	1709638	820581	270019	5903	546	5583	5983	346	13952	1896346	355510
White: Scottish	4445678	1652564	679353	144426	3885	353	3493	2501	246	9843	1653997	295017
White: Other British	417109	49142	32427	101087	1337	94	938	694	39	2826	185371	43154
White: Irish	54090	2742	36427	2812	124	13	20	61	7	205	8690	2989
White: Gypsy/Traveller	4212	800	670	570	57	9	23	25	14	103	1550	391
White: Polish	61201	524	46963	2050	95	9	39	130	4	78	6916	4393
White: Other White	102117	3866	24741	19074	405	68	1070	2572	36	897	39822	9566
Mixed or multiple ethnic groups	19815	1699	3385	1907	242	75	102	1342	50	220	8912	1881
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British: Total	140678	3050	9498	5114	6576	15596	55	54870	8357	702	29944	6916
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British: Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish or Pakistani British	49381	599	443	186	35	59	8	44858	96	29	1248	1820
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British: Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British	32706	644	3596	1480	168	13476	21	1954	7536	279	2185	1367
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British: Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British	3788	67	94	31	12	114	1	3053	9	4	216	187
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British: Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British	33706	1053	1043	2025	3334	130	18	341	30	262	23121	2349
Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British: Other Asian	21097	687	4322	1392	3027	1817	7	4664	686	128	3174	1193
African: Total	29638	2544	5340	11949	22	31	12	5051	2	160	2195	2332
African: African, African Scottish or African British	29186	2531	5298	11919	22	17	11	4779	2	160	2137	2310
African: Other African	452	13	42	30	0	14	1	272	0	0	58	22
Caribbean or Black: Total	6540	601	1250	1626	24	66	7	329	34	65	1986	552
Caribbean or Black: Caribbean, Caribbean Scottish or Caribbean British	3430	325	668	784	19	31	4	31	3	40	1203	322
Caribbean or Black: Black, Black Scottish or Black British	2380	241	438	654	3	2	3	224	0	18	623	174
Caribbean or Black: Other Caribbean or Black	730	35	144	188	2	33	0	74	31	7	160	56
Other ethnic groups: Total	14325	339	999	660	28	65	128	9162	266	97	1733	848
Other ethnic groups: Arab, Arab Scottish or Arab British	9366	206	243	170	14	8	5	7505	12	32	718	453
Other ethnic groups: Other ethnic group	4959	133	756	490	14	57	123	1657	254	65	1015	395